

DATE: 16 December 1971

MEMORANDUM FOR: Capt. Charles Redman

SUBJECT : Results of Photo Comparison,  
Case No. \_\_\_\_\_

REFERENCE : Request from NOK of Joseph P. Fanning

1. Transmitted herewith are results of photo comparison analysis between the Christmas 1969 film of American PWs in North Vietnam and photographs submitted with reference.

2. The evidence cited in the attached report does not constitute definitive proof of the status or identity of individuals portrayed in the questioned photographs.

3. Since the Agency's participation in this program is classified, the fact of such participation must not be revealed. This report, therefore, may not be used in an unclassified arena, and the Agency cannot be responsible for any action or decision based in whole or in part on the judgments expressed in the report.

4. All materials received from your office in connection with subject request are returned herewith.

APPROVED FOR RELEASE  
Date 14 Nov 78

CIA Rep., IPWIC

Attachments:

- (1) Christmas 1969 comparison No. \_\_\_\_\_
- (2) Materials submitted with request:
  - (a) Overlay
  - (b) 0 precapture photos
  - (c) Other: \_\_\_\_\_

0001  
PMP  
DTD 11 Dec 71

23      [REDACTED]      2

Date of Report: 16 December 1971

PHOTO COMPARISON ANALYSIS RESULTS: Christmas 1969 No. \_\_\_\_\_

1. (U) Summary of request: (Date received: \_\_\_\_\_)
  - a. Please compare the attached 0 pre-capture photographs of Joseph P. Fanning with the Christmas 1969 film obtained by Representative Zion, especially prints numbered DIA USN 14, 18 USAF 14-9, 15-4, 16-5; 98-2; 101-4, 102-2, 103-2,  
107-2
  - b. See attached overlay for exact location of image to be compared.
2. (U) Summary of comparison performed:
  - a. The following frames were chosen for comparison with the photographs submitted: \_\_\_\_\_
  - b. \_\_\_\_\_ technicians working independently of each other analyzed the identifiable features listed below.
3. [REDACTED] Results of analysis:
  - a. (U) Quality of pre-capture photographs submitted: Adequate/inadequate for analysis of recognizable features.
  - b. (U) Quality of frames in Christmas film: Adequate/inadequate for analysis of recognizable features.
  - c. [REDACTED] The following features were considered similar:
    - (1) \_\_\_\_\_
    - (2) \_\_\_\_\_
    - (3) \_\_\_\_\_
    - (4) \_\_\_\_\_

- [REDACTED]
- (3) \_\_\_\_\_
  - (4) \_\_\_\_\_
  - (5) \_\_\_\_\_
  - (6) \_\_\_\_\_
  - (7) \_\_\_\_\_
  - (8) \_\_\_\_\_
  - (9) \_\_\_\_\_

d. [REDACTED] The following features were considered dissimilar:


- (1) \_\_\_\_\_
- (2) \_\_\_\_\_
- (3) \_\_\_\_\_
- (4) \_\_\_\_\_
- (5) \_\_\_\_\_

e. [REDACTED] Conclusion:

- (1) In view of the similarity in general appearance and significant number of similar features, \_\_\_\_\_ could be the subject of the questioned photographs.
- (2) In view of the significant number of differences in distinguishable features, \_\_\_\_\_ probably is not the subject of the questioned photographs.
- (3) In view of the quality of photography and the small number of distinguishable features which could be compared, no conclusion can be reached.

f. (U) The same image has been compared with pre-capture photographs of \_\_\_\_\_ Air Force, \_\_\_\_\_ Navy, \_\_\_\_\_ Marine, \_\_\_\_\_ Army, and \_\_\_\_\_ civilian personnel.

g. Comments: Joseph P. Fanning photo comparison: All of the images selected, USAF numbers 14-9, 15-4, 16-5, 98-2, 101-4, 102-2, 103-2, 107-2 and Navy numbers 14 and 18, from the 1969 Christmas film, were inadequate for comparison analysis. In some cases it has been possible to identify otherwise inadequate images by tracing them throughout the film. Regrettably the effort has been fruitless in the cases of 14-9, 15-4, and 16-5. These images were taken of an individual or possibly two individuals at the back of the room during the Protestant service. Image 98-2 was taken of an unidentified individual in the second row of the Catholic service, an individual close to the camera whose PW identification number (TU 2-167) can be clearly seen but who has not yet been identified. Image 107-2 is also in the fourth row of the Catholic service and might be the same individual as TU 2-167, or the man to his left, Lt. Gerald L. Coffee, Navy, who has been positively identified. Navy 14 and Navy 18 images selected have not been identified.

4.  WARNING: This photo comparison analysis was performed utilizing the best available techniques; however, the quality of the photographs in question precluded positive identification. There may be other overriding factors concerning the individual's case which could confirm or invalidate the photo comparison analysis.

Attachments:

- (a) Post-capture photographs, with overlay or other exact identification of image to be compared: \_\_\_\_\_
- (b) Pre-capture photographs: \_\_\_\_\_